

**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**Wednesday, May 1, 2018
4:00 p.m.**

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Commissioners Present: Charissa W. Durst, Jeff Ferriell, Anthony Hartke, Karen McCoy, Mark Ours James Panzer

Commissioners Absent: Ned Thiell

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 4:16 p.m.
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, April 24, 2018 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center);
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, June 5, 2018 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center);
- IV.** SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V.** INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Wednesday, April 3, 2018
MOTION: Panzer/Durst (5-0-1 [Ours-abstain]) APPROVED
- VII.** STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII.** PUBLIC FORUM
 - German Village Commission By-Laws Revisions
 - Revisions required to Article VI (1) and (2) in regard to business meeting and hearing locations and public notice.MOTION: Panzer/Thiell (6-0-0) APPROVED
- IX.** PUBLIC FORUM
 - German Village Commission By-Laws Revisions
 - Revisions required to Article VI (4) in regard to requirements to establish a quorum. These revisions will conform the German Village Commission bylaws with section 3119.07 of Columbus City Code

By-Laws revisions to be revisited at the June 5, 2018 German Village Commission hearing.

NO ACTION TAKEN



X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 18-5-31

705 Macon Alley

Tania Ulloa-Malave (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application # 18-5-31, 705 Macon Alley, for construction of a new pergola, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 5, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Panzer/Ours (6-0-0) CONTINUED

2. 18-5-32

38 Thurman Avenue

Betty A. Garrett (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion, Application #18-5-32, 38 Thurman Avenue, for installation of a new, steel overhead garage door, was WITHDRAWN by the Applicant.

NO ACTION TAKEN

3. 18-5-33

880 South Fifth Street

Jamie Mateljan & Marilyn Vutech (Applicant)

Jamie Mateljan c/o Vutech & Ruff (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-33, 880 South Fifth Street, as amended, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Fence

- Install a new, 6'H, wood, privacy fence on or within the south property line (side yard), up to the east end of the main entrance porch on the south elevation.
- Continue the 6'H fence toward the public sidewalk by installing new 4'H wood fence on or within the south property line (side yard), up to the public sidewalk.
- All fence to be board-on-board, with straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- New fence to be painted or stained within one year.

MOTION: Ours/Ferriell (6-0-0) APPROVED

4. 18-5-34

808 South Lazelle Street

Arthur Neil Cole & Kristen K. Cole (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-34, 808 South Lazelle Street, as amended, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Garage Door

- Remove the existing, metal, overhead garage door on the 1994 dwelling.
- Install new, cedar, carriage house doors with mahogany stain and strap hinges, per the submitted cut sheets.

Install New Light Fixture

- Remove the existing, electric coach light adjacent to overhead garage doors, per the submitted photos.
- Install new, aged copper, gas lantern, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Shutters

- Retain or remove the existing, window shutters above the overhead garage doors, per the submitted photographs.

New Window Boxes

- Remove the existing window boxes above the overhead doors.
- Install new window boxes, per the submitted product cut sheet.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

5. 18-5-35

825 South Fifth Street

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Mary Wilson & Robin Strohm (Owner)

Following presentation by the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-35, 825 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Three-Season Room

- Build a new, 9' 16', three-season room on the rear elevation, per the submitted drawings.
- Windows to be Marvin Infinity, fiberglass windows.
- Fishscale shingles in the closed cornices of the side elevations to match the front gable of the house.
- Painted wood columns, as previously approved for screened porch.
- Shed roof to have asphalt shingles from approved roofing shingles list.

MOTION: Durst/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVED

6. 18-5-36

306 East Sycamore Street

Teresa J Dalenta (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-36, 306 East Sycamore Street, as amended, with all clarifications, as noted:

Brick in Window Opening

- Remove the existing "faux window" trim in the upper left, second-story window opening facing onto S. Grant Street.
- Install black spandrel glass within the existing window casings.
- Install new, wood trim to simulate an upper and lower sash. Trim to match the profile of existing window sashes.

Note: This window opening is walled over on the inside.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

7. 18-4-27 (Not Attending)

210 Thurman Avenue

Jeff Excell & Lauren Culley/Fox in the Snow (Applicants)

Red Gate Partners, LLC (Owners)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # 18-4-27, 210 Thurman Avenue, for installation of heat-applied vinyl "fox" logo, to allow time for the Applicant to consider other material and/or location options, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 5, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (5-0-1[Ours-abstain]) CONTINUED

8. 18-5-37

100 Thurman Avenue

bcf Design & Development, Ltd. (Applicant)

Pamela & Paul Albrecht (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Upon review of Application #18-5-37, 100 Thurman Avenue, the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as submitted:

1. CC 3332.38 Private Garage, Subsection (G) of the zoning code increasing the height of the garage from the limited height of 15 ft. to +/- 22 ft.
2. CC 3332.35 Accessory Building in allowing living space (an atypical use) to be added above the detached garage.

MOTION: Ours/Panzer (6-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

NEW APPLICATIONS

9. 18-5-38

41 Stewart Avenue

Glendon Williams (Applicant)

John & Barbara Young (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-38, 41 Stewart Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications, as noted:

Modify Garage Door Openings

- Modify and repair the existing two (2) garage door openings on the non-contributing garage, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove center concrete block support.
- Install a concealed, engineered beam along the garage door opening to support the load that was distributed by the column.
- Install a single overhead garage door.
- Cut sheet for the wood or steel with wood overlay, carriage style door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Note: A single overhead garage door is being approved at this specific location for the following reasons: 1) A maneuverability issue exists in the rear yard; 2) The existing garage is set back a distance from the public right-of-way and is partially screened from view by the house.

MOTION: Panzer/Ferriell (6-0-0) APPROVED

10. 18-5-39

183 Alexander Alley

Priestas Brothers Builders (Applicant)

Adam Kirkland (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant and Owner, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application # 18-5-39, 183 Alexander Alley, for construction of a new garage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 5, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- Submit revised drawings with scaled down windows, perhaps five 2' x 3' windows.
- Pull the dormer down from the roof ridge about a foot.
- Include metal ridge roll on the roof.
- Model C Woodland Creek garage door, without the arch and hardware, would be appropriate.
- Confirm the actual width of the alley.
- Consider half-round gutters.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) CONTINUED

11. 18-5-40

902 Mohawk Street

Brenda Parker (Applicant)

Mark & Sandra Bordley (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant and Owner, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application # 18-5-40, 902 Mohawk Street, for construction of a new carriage house, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 5, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- Consider Boral siding.
- Consider adding a couple feet to the depth of the garage carriage house for the stairway.
- You may consider aluminum-clad windows and fiberglass doors that do not face a public way.
- Overhead garage doors must be wood or steel with wood overlay.
- Submit a streetscape drawing showing existing garages on either side.
- Will need to have a list of variance for GVC recommendation.

MOTION: Ours/Panzer (6-0-0) CONTINUED

12. 18-5-41

759 South Sixth Street

Matt Mutchler/F5 Design (Applicant)

Jeff & Lynette Woda (Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-5-41, Commissioner Ferriell noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-41, 759 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Convert Porch to Living Space

- Convert the existing, enclosed porch to finished living space, per the submitted drawings (total 188 sf.).
- Flat roof to be converted to gable roof. Roofing to be “Matte Black” 24 gauge, standing-seam-metal with 16” ribs.
- Exterior cladding to be 4” exposure drop siding with 1 x 4 corner boards.
- Siding color to be SW Iron Ore. Trim to be SW Tricorn Black. Doors/Windows to be SW Tricorn Black.
- Stone foundation to match existing on main structure.
- Add a 155 sf flat roof over the existing patio, per the submitted drawings.

Demolish Existing Garage & Build New Garage

- Demolish the existing ca. 1970, non-contributing, non-historic, two-car garage.
- Build a new 544 sf garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Two overhead garage doors to be wood, per the submitted product cut sheet.

MOTION: Ours/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

12a. 18-5-46

31-35 East Livingston Ave.

Jonathan Barnes (Applicant)

Mark Patel/Luxe Hotel (Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-5-46, Commissioner Ferriell returned to the table.

Build New Hotel

- Second conceptual review for a new 3-6 story hotel, per the submitted drawings.
- Hotel to include 156 rooms.
- Primary exterior materials to include veneer brick and aluminum and glass windows.
- Underground parking provided with 148 spaces.

Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Ours:

- Would like to see the view on the left - the view of the historic former restaurant in comparison to the new building. Also from High Street looking east.
- Gets the three story thing on the edge, and can probably buy into that. Would like to see the transition of how harsh that is as it steps there, and how close you are.
- Can buy the three stories and can probably get my head around the four. Would like to see more information about Pearl Street – a streetscape going south.
- Thinks maybe the six stories works better on E. Livingston Avenue than on Pearl Street. Would like to see more about how that relates to the surroundings contextually. Need to understand whether six stories is appropriate for German Village on the south.
- Buys the Brewery District discussion - all of the property to the west may get developed.
- It's a fantastic idea to give the corner of City Park and E. Livingston to retail, but does not love the idea that E. Livingston side is more solid than the City Park side. Would like to see it be a Livingston address from a retail point of view.
- Need to be promoting a walkable community as E. Livingston gets developed. Maybe do something to emphasize the storefront and make less a part of the hotel.
- Mostly worried about the transition to the south. Thinks Commissioner McCoy's suggestion of more height on Livingston may be a good one.
- Thinks it is dangerous to think that the "transitional area" is only outside of the German Village boundary. If we don't control our own edges, where the Commission, Society, and residents actually have a say, we will have no control over what the transition actually ends up being. To think that the "edge conditions" should be left up to the Brewery District Commission and everything in German Village should be two stories is incredibly myopic and short-sighted, and not very forward thinking.
- More height on Livingston is more palatable because it is not immediately adjacent to German Village context. It's ramping up to the thoroughfare.

Commissioner Panzer:

- Typically these corner pieces, like the one across the street (468 City Park Ave), are about the corner.
- Wonders if the Livingston piece could come all the way to City Park and the transitional piece would be the part going back down City Park.
- It appears we are moving beyond the massing question and getting into more detail, but not sure if the commission is buying into what is being proposed on Pearl Street.
- Struggling with the overall height. Not sure if this can be considered a transitional piece into the Brewery District.
- Need to consider how the north side of E. Livingston is being developed. Would this building have the appearance of a wall against the park on the south side?
- Shifting height to E. Livingston should be explored.

Commissioner Durst:

- It seems like the retail space should wrap around the corner and read as one unit.
- Thinks the Pearl Street side needs to transition down in height to the existing three-story buildings on Blenkner Street. Can see the height extending as far as Brewer's Alley. Once you get down Pearl Street and that existing empty lot, that will one day be developed, would not want that developer to think a six-story building would be appropriate adjacent to existing three-story buildings.
- If this were a three-story building, because German Village is a three-story community, but with a fourth story accent at the corner, similar to the "Castle," there would be no problem. Might be able to say it's at the extreme edge and fronting the highway and Brewery District, so maybe we can bump it up a story. But to go five and six continuously down one elevation is too much for me.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Wonders what will be visible on the second, third, and fourth floors of the C-shape piece when on City Park going north.
- Has not yet bought into the massing/height along Pearl Street.
- The rest of the development speaks to the massing and height of the neighborhood.
- Does not think of the south side of Livingston as a transitional area in regard to the German Village guidelines.
- Likes the project, but not quite there on the proposed height.
- Appreciates the parking effort. The parking ratio is fantastic.

Commissioner McCoy:

- Has the low roof in the center of the courtyard been considered as an outdoor space? It seems like an opportunity.
- Does not have as big an issue with the height as with the transition between the building blocks.
- Because of what is present in the Brewery District and as you look to the north, finds the elevation along Pearl Street more acceptable than some other views looking toward the city, but has more trouble with the abrupt transitions between stories four and six.
- Might be better to see more height on Livingston than on Pearl Street. Consider adding a floor on Livingston and losing one on Pearl Street.

Commissioner Ferriell:

- Is willing to hear more of Commissioner Ours views about the edge conditions, but the height and massing is not what I want to see anywhere in German Village. The fourth story of the Schwartz Castle detracts from the historic character, and should have never been built. It detracts from the historic character of the original house.
- Thinks this proposal will detract from the historic character of the neighborhood- largely because of the height.
- A good job has been done in being sensitive to the architecture in other respects.
- Understands there will be massing on the other side of Pearl Street. Does not want to create a tunnel. This starts the tunnel on Pearl.
- Is happy to look at a proposal with more height shifted to Livingston from Pearl. Willing to listen further to commissioner Our's input.

Following the presentation by the Applicant and discussion, Chairperson Hartke called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Nancy Kotting German Village Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The design is commendable. The parking solution is wonderful. • Appreciates the sensitivity to increasing pedestrian traffic. • The spirit of architecture in German Village is respected. • A hotel is something that the residents have been asking for. • Has grave concerns about proposed height. German Village should not be expected to participate in creating future urban canyons. • Looks forward to welcoming a new business to the district.

Following additional presentation by the Applicant and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application # 18-6-41, 756 City Park Avenue, for new window installation, to allow the applicants time to do further research on window details, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 5, 2018, German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) CONTINUED

Commissioner Comments:

13. 18-5-42

804 City Park Avenue & 76 Kossuth Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Nelson Heinrichs, III (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-5-42, 804 City Park Avenue & 76 Kossuth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Combine Two Properties Into One Single Family Residence

76 Kossuth Street

- Remove existing, aluminum, shed roof structure on rear elevation.
- Remove Bilco basement access on rear elevation.
- Remove existing aluminum siding for discovery of condition of original siding and trim.

804 City Park Avenue

- Remove existing, overhead garage doors, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Install new, flush panel and wood trim to match original doors.
- Construct a new, one-story, frame addition, per the submitted drawings.
- Convert east elevation kitchen window to a French door, per the submitted drawings.
- Relocate required egress window to north wall of existing structure.
- Exterior cladding to be 4", smooth, wood lap siding, to match existing on 804 City Park.
- Windows and doors to be wood Marvin products, 7/8" SDL's where shown, with 2" flat casings.
- Foundation to be split-face concrete block, to match existing.
- Roofing to be GAF Slateline asphalt shingles, color to be per approved list.
- Gutters to be 5" half-rounds with round leaders.
- Landscaping, paving, and steps to be submitted for review at a future GVC hearing.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

14. 18-5-43

795 South Fifth Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Jeffrey Patrasso (Owner)

Convert Garage to Carriage House

- First conceptual review to convert and existing, two-car garage to a carriage house.
- Build a second floor addition as a guest suite.
- Build a stairway addition on rear yard elevation
- BZA variance would be required.

Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Ours:

- Thinks the proposed project is “do-able, ” based on the drawings submitted during the May 1st, 2018 GVC hearing.
- Study the dormer windows a bit more. Perhaps they should be wider.
- Would not want to see the garage turned, with a large gable facing onto Macon Alley.

Commissioner Durst:

- In agreement with Commissioner Ours.

NO ACTION TAKEN

15. 18-5-44

325-327 E. Livingston Ave.

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Tom Willoughby (Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-5-44, Chairperson Hartke noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room. Vice-Chairperson Panzer assumed the role of Chairperson.

- First conceptual review to convert two, existing structures to residential use from current office use.
- Build a new structure along East Livingston Avenue streetscape, to include two apartments.
- Currently zoned C-4, so would require Council Variance.

Following presentation by the Applicant, acting Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Ours:

- Is all for filling in the street wall.
- Will need to find a way to design and site a new building on Livingston Avenue, and still respect the building at the rear of the lot.
- Would it be possible to have a courtyard?
- The siting is awkward, but existing.
- The conversion to residential from the existing office use is a positive.

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 18-5-45

247-281 East Livingston Ave.

Berardi + (Applicant)

Cedar Square, LLC. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-5-44, Chairperson Hartke returned to the table.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, ca. 1981, two-story, brick building at 247-257 E. Livingston Avenue, per the submitted photographs. To be replaced by “Building A.”

New Construction / 247-257 E. Livingston Avenue (Bldg A)

- Build a new, three-story, 22 unit, residential building with roof deck.
- Conceptual options 1, 2, and 3 as shown on A6.2a, A6.2b, and A6.2c.

New Construction / Vacant Lot / 277 E. Livingston (Bldg E)

- Build a new, three-story, 18 unit, residential building as shown on A1.2.

Renovation of Existing Structures

- Renovate existing structures for use as 11-1 bedroom units, as shown on A1.1.

Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Ours:

- Is comfortable with the zoning. Thanks for getting the unit mix.
- Only trepidation left on the massing is the fourth story “catbird.” Gets the fourth story from the Livingston Ave perspective. It’s the fourth story, sort of, “wedding cake mountain,” on Blenkner that is troubling. Does it have to be like a penthouse parked on top? Could be okay if the architecture found a way to consume it.
- The drawings provided along Blenkner are very helpful.
- Likes Option A. However, Option B might most be most successful with the context, followed by Option C.
- The way B and C articulate their roof, and it engages the roof – it becomes more contextual.
- Recommend following the B or C paradigm as a way to inhabit the uppermost floor- as sort of roof occupied.
- Option C could work well on the piece that’s in the back.

Commissioner Hartke:

- The Commission needs to see how Building and Building E relate to each other.
- Not sure whether the two buildings should be the same or different from each other.
- Appreciates how parking has been resolved and the Options that fit in with the context.

Commissioner Durst:

- Is very happy with the direction of the project.

Commissioner McCoy:

- The current proposal is a great improvement.
- Look at working to blend in the fourth floor pent house.
- Option C (A6.2c) seems to look not as tall.

NO ACTION TAKEN

17. 18-5-46

674 South Third Street

David B. Meleca/David B. Meleca Architects, LLC (Applicant) **Bishop Frederick Campbell (Owner)**
Fr. Lutz and Bryan Hamilton of The Hamilton Group Ohio provided a project update at the February 2018 GVC hearing. An application, site plan, elevation drawings, and photographs have been submitted.

Church Building Renovations

- Install new, stained, 2-panel front doors to match historic photos.
- Install new dimensional asphalt shingles.
- Replace exterior front steps.
- Install new aluminum storm windows to protect stained-glass windows.
- Install new front terrace and landscaping.
- Public sidewalks and street to remain, as is.

Specht Center

- Refurbish existing front doors.
- Remove existing chimneys.
- Install new dimensional asphalt shingles.
- Build new front porch.
- Install new sidewalks and landscaping.
- Install new exterior globe fixtures.
- Install new round downspouts.

Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- In general, most of the work will be approvable by Historic Preservation Office staff with submittal of a new application.
- The final landscape/hardscape plan will need to be submitted for review by the Commission.
- Suggest providing a larger tree lawn space for planting the trees, perhaps 5' x 10' with some ground cover.
- While there was not originally a porch or door hood over the south elevation entrance on the Specht Center (original school building), the need for it is appreciated and it would not be visible from a public right-of-way.
- A porch should be simple in design.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants are not required to attend)

- **18-5-1**

245 Jackson Street

Brad J. Bushman (Applicant)

Brad J. Bushman & Tamara R. Stafford (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-1, 245 Jackson Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install Gutter Leaf Guards

- Remove the existing, arched gutter screens from the existing half-round gutters, on all elevations.
- Install new, flat, metal gutter protection system, to fit inside existing gutters.

- **18-5-2**

1010 Jaeger Street

Glendon Williams/Kiwi Home Renovations (Applicant)

Kay Huebner (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-2, 1010 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wood privacy fence along the south side of the property, per the submitted photographs and site plan.
- Remove the existing tree stump located in the fence line.
- Install a new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence, on, or within the south property line in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be a board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts, per the submitted photograph.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **18-5-3 [Panzer]**

632 South Fifth Street

Amy Weis (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-3, 632 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Fence

- Remove the existing, wood privacy fence on the east and north sides of the rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, six-foot-high (6' H), wood privacy fence in same locations, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of new fence to board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **18-5-4 [Panzer]**

640 South Fifth Street

Michele Whitaker (Applicant)

Michele & David Whitaker (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-4, 640 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Fence

- Remove the existing, wood privacy fence on the north, east and south sides of the rear yard, in consultation with the neighboring property owners to the north and south.
- Install new, six-foot-high (6' H), wood privacy fence in same locations. Fence along north and south sides of property to be on or within the property lines of 640 South Fifth Street, in consultation with the neighboring property owners to the north and south. Style of new fence to board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **18-5-5 [Ours]**

179 East Deshler Avenue

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Chip Burke (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-5, 179 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove all existing (12 total), wood windows on all elevations.
- Install new, Marvin, Next Generation 2.0, aluminum-clad wood, 2/2 double-hung sash windows with 2" flat casings, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Window sizes to match existing openings.

Note: COA # 18-5-5 modifies COA # 17-12-28c (December 5, 2017).

- **18-5-6**

862 Mohawk Street

Mary Wolfe (Applicant)

Michael Cornelis & Susan Riley (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-6, 862 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all existing shingles from the backside family room down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	Weathered Slate
------------	--------------------------------	------------------------
- All ridges to be capped with pre-finished step flashing in lieu of cut shingle tabs, with Terra Bronze color.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via GAF Snow Country Ridge Vent, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **18-5-7**

503 S. Third Street

Jon Halverstadt (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-7, 503 S. Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Spot Tuck Point--(partial)

- Check all mortar joints for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

- **18-5-8**

870 South Lazelle Street

Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)

Nataniel Saguisi (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-8, 870 South Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove all existing windows on the ca. 1981, frame house, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, Marvin, Next Generation 2.0, aluminum-clad wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Exterior color of new windows to be "White."
- All new windows and jambs to fit within the existing window openings.

- **18-5-9**

913 S. Lazelle Street

Joe Meinking (Applicant)

Christina Ching (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-9, 913 S. Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Wood Siding

- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval
- Remove Non-Contributing Shingle Siding
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Repair/replace any/all original, existing wood siding with any/all new wood siding to match the original wood siding profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Any/all repaired/replaced exterior trim elements (i.e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the shingle siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches.

- **18-5-10 [Ours]**

588 S. Third Street

German Village Society (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-10, 588 S. Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

Remove and Install New Flat Roof Membrane

- Remove front porch roofing down to existing wooden deck. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Repair any/all decking and roofing components, as necessary and in accordance with manufacturer's specifications, industry standards, and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Install new 1.5 ISO underlayment between wooden decking and new membrane.
- Install new 0.045EPDM rubber membrane according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new perimeter edge metal and termination bar at the house wall.

- **18-5-11**

986 Jaeger Street

Jeff/Jeani Stahler (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-11, 986 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Concrete Steps

- Remove the deteriorated, concrete front porch steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete steps in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

- **18-5-12 [Ours]**

181 Thurman Avenue

Ben Goodman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-12, 181 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove existing windows
- Replace with Trimline's Heritage all-wood primed sash replacement system of windows
- New window sash to fit the size of the original window sash.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Note: No exterior alterations are to be made to any existing exterior window openings.

- **18-5-13**

756-758 S. Fifth Street

Dan & Kathy Rupp (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-13, 756-758 S. Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Stain Wood Siding

- Change the color of the stain on the cedar siding located on the rear of the building from a cedar stain to Sherwin Williams (SW7032) Warm Stone.

- **18-5-14**

739 S. Third Street

Evan Fracasso (Applicant) German Village LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-14, 739 S. Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install Downspouts

- Install new downspout from the existing gutter.

- Replacement downspout will be copper to match the previous material.

- **18-5-15**

159-161 E. Blenkner Street

Michael Joyce (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-15, 159-161 E. Blenkner Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any broken/missing metal or tile coping like-for-like, and retain any existing metal or tile coping during roof replacement.

- **18-5-16**

237 E. Kossuth Street

Amanda Stearns & Jennifer Lombardi (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-16, 237 E. Kossuth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Paint Aluminum Siding

- Following any/all necessary repairs to the aluminum siding and trim, prepare all aluminum siding for painting in accordance with all applicable industry standards and manufacturers' specifications. Power wash all metal surfaces with a maximum pressure of 300 lb./p. s. i. and broad fan tip nozzle.
- Apply the appropriate exterior paint for aluminum surfaces, in accordance with industry standards and manufacturers' specifications.
- Determine whether the siding is aluminum or galvanized steel by applying a strong magnet. If it sticks to the siding, it is steel, which should not be painted with any oil based paint.
- Following any/all necessary repairs to the aluminum siding and trim, prepare all aluminum siding for painting in accordance with all applicable industry standards and manufacturers' specifications. Power wash all metal surfaces with a maximum pressure of 300 lb./p. s. i. and broad fan tip nozzle.
- Apply the appropriate exterior paint for aluminum surfaces, in accordance with industry standards and manufacturers' specifications.
- Paint exterior siding Sherwin Williams (SW0048) Bunglehouse Blue and paint trim and gutters Sherwin Williams (SW2808) Rookwood Dark Brown.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing picket wood fence and install a new picket wood fence in the exact same location, approximately 145 feet.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Paint to be Sherwin Williams (SW2808) Rookwood Dark Brown.
- Note: fence replacement does NOT include the 6 foot tall privacy sections of fence.

Paint Exterior Door

- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing front and side entry doors per industry standards.
- Paint to be Sherwin Williams (SW6685) Trinket on the existing front and side entry doors

- **18-5-17**

724 S. Fifth Street

Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant) Mr. Cohen(Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-17, 724 S. Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair/Relay Brick Driveway

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated brick from the driveway and sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new or used brick in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• **18-5-18 [Ours]**

181 Thurman Avenue

Ben Goodman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-18, 181 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

• **18-5-19**

768 City Park Drive

Pat Ryan (Applicant)

Kathrine Jenkins and Parker Sutton (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-19, 768 City Park Drive, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing wood privacy fence and install a new six-feet high (6' H), wood privacy fence in the rear yard as shown per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain color to be Sherwin Williams (SW3533) Leeward.

• **18-5-20 [Ours]**

188 Thurman Avenue

Mary Wolfe/Feazel (Applicant)

Anita Suclescy (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-20, 188 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Flat Roof Membrane—Front Porch

- Remove front porch roofing down to existing wooden deck. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Repair any/all decking and roofing components, as necessary and in accordance with manufacturer's specifications, industry standards, and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Install new 1.5 ISO underlayment between wooden decking and new membrane.
- Install new 0.045EPDM rubber membrane according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new perimeter edge metal and termination bar at the house wall.

Re-secure or Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingles

- Re-secure any loose shingles on the west side roofing system.

- Remove all damaged shingles on the west side roofing system. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing shingles with the same type, style, color, and appropriate dimension, as the remaining existing shingles.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- **18-5-21**

870 S. Third Street
John Rosenberry (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-21, 870 S. Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
 - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:
- | <u>Manufacturer:</u> | <u>Style:</u> | <u>Color:</u> |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF | Slateline (dimensional) | <input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate |
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
 - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Windows

- Remove deteriorated attic wood window on the south side as shown in submitted photos.
- Remove the non-original window on the north side as shown in submitted photos.
- Install new, Pella Architectural Series, 1/1 double-hung wood windows.
- Re-use the existing framing materials around both openings.
- Window sizes to match existing openings.

- **18-5-22**

207 Thurman Avenue

Bill Weiner Roofing, Ltd. (Applicant)

Fortin Holdings (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-22, 207 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the commercial building, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Any existing tile or metal coping to be retained, or replaced in-like-kind.

• **18-5-23 [Ferriell]**

783 S. Sixth Street

Kiwi Home Renovations (Applicant)

Cathy Holdrieth (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-23, 783 S. Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Fence

- Remove the deteriorated existing wood fence and gate on the Eastern boundary per the submitted site plan.
- New fence and gate to be wrought iron per the submitted pictures and application.
- New fence and gate are to be installed in the exact same located as the removed fence.

• **18-5-24**

745 Mohawk Street

Chadwick Brubaker (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-24, 745 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Paint exterior body of the house Ben Moore #2125-20 and paint trim Sherwin Williams (SW7551) Greek Villa White.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Install New Door

- Install new, ¾ Lite Clear 1-Panel **Wood** door on the front of the house.
- Paint exterior door Ben Moore Red #AF290

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove the scrolled metal porch supports.
- Replace the porch supports with square wood posts.
- Paint new square wood posts Sherwin Williams (SW7551) Greek Villa White.

- **18-5-25**

145 E. Beck Street

Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Peter & Laurie Danis (Owner)

Approve Application 18-5-25, 145 E. Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair/Relay Brick Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated brick from sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new or used brick in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension and pattern, as necessary.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.
- Add a standard gravel screening under re-laid bricks
- Add a 4" tall limestone edging along Rader Alley aligned with the existing curb
- All work to be completed in consultation with the Department of Public Service, and per all applicable City Building Codes.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards, to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.
- Brickwork around the existing tree in the public sidewalk to be done in consultation with the Recreation and Parks Department City Forester.

Landscaping

- Install Rose bushes and perennials along Rader Alley as per submitted plan.
- Install Landscape planting in the front of the residence as per submitted plan.
- Install free standing wrought iron trellis in the front of the residence as per submitted plan.
- Install Planter Pot in the front of the residence as per submitted plan.
- Install Magnolia Tree in the front of the residence as per submitted plan. Tree to be an appropriate size as not to disturb the brick sidewalk.

Gate

- Install 6' tall wrought iron gate between 145 E. Beck Street and 143 E. Beck Street as per submitted plan.
- Installation to be done in consultation with the owner of 143 E. Beck Street.

XI. OLD BUSINESS

XII. NEW BUSINESS

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (8:38 p.m.)

German Village Commission
May 1, 2018 Minutes
20